



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 9, 2003

Ms. Cynthia Villarreal-Reyna
Section Chief
Legal and Compliance Division
Texas Department of Insurance
P.O. Box 149104 MC 110-1A
Austin, Texas 78714-9104

OR2003-7158

Dear Ms. Villarreal-Reyna:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 189390.

The Texas Department of Insurance (the "department") received a request for the names, addresses and phone numbers of all individuals, agents and/or agencies currently under investigation with the department. You inform us that, in accordance with a previous determination issued to the department, you will withhold any information or material acquired by the department that relates to a fraud investigation under section 5(a) of article 1.10D of the Texas Insurance Code. *See* Open Records Letter No. 95-1536 (1995) (determining information acquired by the department that is relevant to an inquiry by the insurance fraud unit that the commissioner deems confidential is excepted from disclosure); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 608 (1992) (information acquired by department's Insurance Fraud Unit and which the commissioner determines must remain confidential is confidential under section 5(a) of article 1.10D). You claim that the remainder of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.103 provides as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the

state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

....

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

The department has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show that the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the governmental body receives the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *University of Tex. Law Sch. v. Texas Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The department must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under 552.103(a). This office has determined that a contested case under the Administrative Procedure Act, chapter 2001 of the Government Code, constitutes litigation for the purposes of section 552.103. See Open Records Decision No. 588 at 7 (1991).

To establish that litigation is reasonably anticipated, a governmental body must provide this office "concrete evidence showing that the claim that litigation may ensue is more than mere conjecture." Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). In the context of anticipated litigation by a governmental body, the concrete evidence must at least reflect that litigation is "realistically contemplated." See Open Records Decision No. 518 at 5 (1989); see also Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982) (finding that investigatory file may be withheld from disclosure if governmental body attorney determines that it should be withheld pursuant to section 552.103 and that litigation is "reasonably likely to result"). Whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. See Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986).

The department is charged with regulating the insurance industry and ensuring that the Texas Insurance Code and other laws regarding insurance and insurance companies are executed. See Ins. Code § 31.002. You state that the submitted list of open case files relate to ongoing investigations being pursued by the department's Legal and Compliance Division and that the department anticipates initiating administrative litigation or enforcement action in all of these files. Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude that you have demonstrated that the open case file information relates to anticipated

litigation. Thus, the information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.103 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this

ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Debbie K. Lee", with a stylized flourish at the end.

Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 189390

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. James B. Lummus
DepPro Advocate Group
2591 Dallas Parkway, Suite 300-23
Frisco, Texas 75034
(w/o enclosures)